

M.A. seminar 2018-2019

פרופ' סילבי הוניגמן

Religious Dynamics in the Eastern Part of the Mediterranean Basin in Hellenistic and early imperial times

הדינמיקה הדתית האגן המזרחי של הים התיכון בתקופה ההלניסטית-רומית

בתקופה ההלניסטית חל שינויי בתפיסת העולם האלהי באזורים שונים של החלק המזרחי של אגם הים התיכון. עיקור השינוי הוא בתפיסה שהאלים רחוקים יותר, ושלא ניתן להכיר את רצונם. במיוחד, התחושה היתה שהזיקה המסורתית בין מעשים טובים ושכר מחד גיסא, ובין מעשים רעים וענישה מאידך גיסא, אינה נכונה עוד. ניתן להבחין את השינוי הזה בדת היוונית (או ליתר דיוק, בחברה היוונית), בספרות החוכמה הדמוטית במצרים, ובספרות החוכמה היהודאית. הסמינר יסקור את השינויים האלה על מגוונים ויתחקה אחר הסיבות האפשריות לכך. נתחקה אחר סיבות פוליטיות, חברתיות, כלכליות. בנוסף נתחקה אחר סוגיות של, מוביליות מוגברת של בני אדם ושל אלים מאזור לאזור ומחברה לחברה, של התחברות מרחבית. אמנם הדגש יהיה על החברה היוונית, אך לא נסתפק בכך.

In Hellenistic times a shift in the conception of the divine may be observed in a variety of societies in the Eastern part of the Mediterranean basin. Most conspicuously, the gods were perceived as being remote, and their will as arbitrary. In particular, the feeling prevailed that the link between good deeds and reward on the one hand, and bad deeds and punishment, on the other, was not true any longer, and that reward and punishment were arbitrary. Expressions of this shift are documented in Greek religion (or rather, on Greek society of Hellenistic times), as well as in Demotic (Egyptian) and Judaeon wisdom literature of Hellenistic times. The seminar will survey the expressions of this shift and investigate possible facilitating factors of it—political, social, economic. The issues of increased mobility for both human beings and gods; and of inter-regional connectivity will be tackled, as well. Emphasis will be lay on, but not restricted to, aspects relating to Greek society.

1. GENERAL INTRODUCTION

Hesiod, *Theogonia*, vv. 27-28

Herodotus 1.45-55, 91-92 (Kroisos and Apollo's oracle)

2. THE SOCIAL STRUCTURES OF INDIVIDUATION IN THE MEDITERRANEAN: MOBILITY, WARFARE

- Chaniotis, Angelos. 2008. *War in The Hellenistic World: A Social and Cultural History*. Chapter 8: An Age of Miracles and Saviors: The Effects of Hellenistic Wars on Religion.

Chaniotis, Angelos. 2013. "Empathy, Emotional Display, Theatricality, and Illusion in Hellenistic Historiography." In *Unveiling Emotions II. Emotions in Greece and Rome: Texts, Images, Material Culture*, ed. A. Chaniotis and P. Ducrey, 53–84. Stuttgart: Steiner.

ASSOCIATIONS

Gabrielsen, Vincent. 2007. "Brotherhoods of Faith and Provident Planning: The Non-public Associations of the Greek World." *Mediterranean Historical Review* 22:2: 183–210.

Vlassopoulos, Kostas. 2007. "Beyond and Below the Polis: Networks, Associations, and the Writing of Greek History." *Mediterranean Historical Review* 22:1: 11–22. DOI: 10.1080/09518960701538507

4. GENRES AND SOCIETY: THE GREEK WORLD

WHY DID THE GENRE OF WISDOM NOT DEVELOPED IN A FULL-FLEDGED WAY IN GREEK SOCIETY?

Crawford [Thompson] D. J. “The Good Official of Ptolemaic Egypt.” In *Das ptolemäische Ägypten. Akten des internationalen Symposions, 27. –29. September 1976 in Berlin*, ed. H. Maehler and V. M. Strocka, 195–202. Mainz am Rhein: P. von Zabern, 1978.

Morgan, Teresa. 1998. *Literate Education in the Hellenistic and Roman Worlds*. Cambridge. Ch. 4, “Literature II: Maxims and Morals,” pp. 120–51.

WISDOM

5. INTRODUCTION TO WISDOM: JUDEA, MESOPOTAMIA, AND EGYPT (DEMOTIC)

● ON “WISDOM LITERATURE:”

Goff, Matthew. 2010. “Qumran Wisdom Literature and the Problem of Genre.” *Dead Sea Discoveries* 17.3: 286–306. Read pp. 286–89, 296–300.

Kynes, William L. 2018. “The ‘Wisdom Literature’ Category: An Obituary.” *Journal of Theological Studies* 69.1: 1–24. Read pp. 1 (“abstract”), 14–19, 21–22.

● THE NOTION OF “WISDOM” IN “WISDOM LITERATURE”

● Stewart, Anne W. 2016. ‘Wisdom’s Imagination: Moral Reasoning and the Book of Proverbs’, *JSOT* 40: 351–72.

▪ The personification of wisdom:

Proverbs 1; 8; 9

Ben Sira 24 (composed ca. 200 BCE)

Wisdom of Solomon 7–9 (Hellenistic composition)

▪ Proverb 22:17-24:22 vs. the Egyptian Instruction of Amenemope

▪ Proverbs of Ahiqar

6. RETRIBUTION: THE BOOK OF JOB & PARALLELS: THE POLITICS OF AMBIGUITY

▪ Job: **chs 1-5, 12-15, 18, 20-22, 29-31, 38-42**

▪ The *Dialogue about Human Misery* (or *Babylonian Theodicy*): in Wilfred G. Lambert, *Babylonian Wisdom Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1963, pp. 61–91.

▪ The Dialogue of Pessimism (The Dialogue between a Master and his Servant), Babylonia, ca. 1000 BCE in B. R. Foster, *Before the Muses: An Anthology of Akkadian Literature* (Bethesda: CDL Press, 2005), pp. 923–26.

▪ The Dialogue between a Man tired of Life and his Ba (“Soul”), in John L. Foster, *Ancient Egyptian Literature: An Anthology* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2001), pp. 55–69.

- Breed, Brennan W., Davis Hankins C. 2011. "Job." In *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Books of the Bible*, ed. Michael D. Coogan. New York: OUP. Vol. 1: 436–50. Read pp. 438–443 (summary of content of the Book of Job)
- Newsom, Carol A. 2002. "The Book of Job as Polyphonic Text." *JSOT* 97: 87–108.
- Newsom, Carol A. *The Book of Job: A Contest of Moral Imaginations*. Oxford: OUP.
 ch. 9. 234–58: The voice from the Whirlwind: The Tragic Sublime and the Limits of Dialogue

7. QOHELET AND 4QINSTRUCTIONS

- Bundvad, M. 2015. *Time in the Book of Ecclesiastes*. Oxford Theology and Religion Monographs. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
 Ch. 3, World Time and Human Time in the Framing Poems. Read pp. 46-61.
 Ch. 4, The Present in the Book of Qohelet. Read pp. 83-109.
- Goff, Matthew J. 2013. *4QInstructions*. Wisdom Literature from the Ancient World. Atlanta, Ga: SBL. Pp. 1-29, "Introduction."
- *4Q417 I i* in Goff, Matthew J. 2013. *4QInstructions*. Wisdom Literature from the Ancient World. Atlanta, Ga: SBL.

8. SHAPING THE SECTARIAN SELF IN QUMRAN

● Individuation in Judea

- Hengel, Martin, *Judaism and Hellenism: Studies in their Encounter in Palestine during the Early Hellenistic Period*, 2 vols (London: SCM Press, 1974)
- Horsley, R. A., and Tiller, P. 2002. "Ben Sira and the Sociology of the Second Temple". In *Second Temple Studies III: Studies in Politics, Class and Material Culture*, ed. P. R. Davies and J. M. Halligan, 74–107. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.
- Shalom, Nitsan, Oded Lipschits, Noa Shatil and Yuval Gadot, Judah in the "Long Third Century B.C.E."—An Archaeological Perspective. In *Judea in the Long Third Century BCE: The Transition between the Persian and Hellenistic Periods*, edited by Sylvie Honigman, Oded Lipschits, and Christophe Nihan. Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns.
- Sources:
 Ben Sira 38:24-39:11
 C.Ord.Ptol. 21-22
- ### ● Newsom, Carol A. 2004. *The Self as Symbolic Space: Constructing Identity and Community at Qumran*. Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah 52. Leiden; Boston: Brill.
- Ch. 1: Communities of Discourse:" pp. 1-22.
 Ch. 4, "How to Made a Sectarian" Formation of Language, Self, and Community in the Serek ha-Yahad. Read pp. 91-117
- Sources:

1QS *Serekh ha-Yahad* (Rule of the Community) **Read: 1QS 1-7** (Including 1QS 3:13-4:26: The Two Spirits Treatise)

Eckhardt, Benedikt. 2018. In *T&T Clark Companion to the Dead Sea Scrolls*, ed. George J. Brooke, and Charlotte Hempel. Bloomsbury Companion. Bloomsbury: T&T Clark.

9. INDIVIDUATION IN GREEK RELIGION: INTRODUCTION

INDIVIDUATION AND INDIVIDUALIZATION

Rüpke, Jörg. 2013. "Introduction. Individualization and individuation as concepts for historical research." In *The Individual in the Religions of the Ancient Mediterranean Attribution*, ed. Jörg Rüpke, 3-38. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

ELEUSIS AND ITS PHILOSOPHICAL ECHOES

Waldner, Katharina. 2013. "Dimensions of individuality in ancient mystery cults: religious practice and philosophical discourse." In *The Individual in the Religions of the Ancient Mediterranean Attribution*, ed. Jörg Rüpke, 215-42. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

Homeric Hymn of Demeter, 471-85

Herodotus 2.171.2

Plato, *Symposium* 201d-212c

10. FEELING THE PRESENCE OF THE GODS: INCUBATION AND MYSTERY CULTS

ASKLEPIOS

Martavou, Paraskevi. 2012. "Dream, Narrative, and the Construction of Hope in the "Healing Miracles" of Epidauros." In *Unveiling Emotions: Sources and Methods for the Study of Emotions in the Greek World*, edited by Angelos Chaniotis, 177–204. Stuttgart: F. Steiner.

Panagiotidou, Olympia. 2014. "The Asklepios Cult: Where Brains, Minds, and Bodies interact with the World, creating New Realities." *Journal of Cognitive History* 1.1 (2014) 14-23.

▪ Sources

LiDonnici, L. R. 1995. *The Epidaurian Inscriptions. Text, Translation, and Commentary*. Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press. (the iamnata inscriptions)

Edelstein & Edelstein, nos 432, 435, 439, 417, and 418 (individual inscriptions and literary sources)

MYSTERY CULT: ISIS ARETALOGIES AND APULEIUS

Martavou, Paraskevi. 2012. "Isis Aretalogies, Initiations, and Emotions: The Isis Aretalogies as a Source for the Study of Emotions." In *Unveiling Emotions*, ed. A. Chaniotis, 267–291. Stuttgart: Steiner.

Whitmarsh, Tim. 2013. "An I for an I: Reading Fictional Autobiography." In *The Author's Voice in Classical and Late Antiquity*, ed. A. Marmodoro and J. Hill. Oxford.

Apuleius, Golden Ass;
Isis Aretalogies & Proverbs 8

11. FROM RITUAL PURITY TO MORAL PURITY

- In the Greek World

Chaniotis, A. 2012. Greek Ritual Purity: From Automatism to Moral Distinctions.” In *How Purity Is Made*, ed. Petra Rösch and Udo Simon, 123-39. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

- Moral Agency in Qumran

Newsom, Carol A. 2012. “Models of the Moral Self: Hebrew Bible and Second Temple Judaism.” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 131. 1: 5–25.

Damascus Document II 1–17

12. INDIVIDUALIZED RELIGION IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

Chaniotis, Angelos. 2011. “Emotional Community through Ritual: Initiates, Citizens, and Pilgrims as Emotional Communities in the Greek World.” In *Ritual Dynamics in the Ancient Mediterranean: Agency, Emotion, Gender, Representation*, ed. A. Chaniotis, 263-90. Stuttgart: Steiner.

- **Wendt**, Heidi. 2016. *At the Temple Gates: The Religion of Freelance Experts in the Roman Empire*. New York: Oxford University Press. Pp. 1-22.

Lucian of Samosata, *Alexander the False Prophet* (Alexander of Abonoteichus)

Paul, Letter to the Philippians

13. ELATED DIVINE

Chaniotis, Angelos. 2010. “Megatheism: The Search for the Almighty God and the Competition of Cults”, in *One God: Pagan Monotheism in the Roman Empire*, ed. by Stephen Mitchell and Peter van Nufflen, 112–140. Cambridge.

Ando, Clifford. 2013. Subjects, gods, and empire, or monarchism as a theological problem. In *The Individual in the Religions of the Ancient Mediterranean Attribution*, ed. Jörg Rüpke, 85–106. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

Versnel, H.S. 1993. “Religious projection: A Hellenistic Instance.” In *Religious Transformation and Socio-Political Change*, ed. Luther Martin, 25–39. Berlin and New York: Mouton de Gruyter.