The Journal of Israeli History

Volume 28, Number 1, March 2009

CONTENTS

Abstracts

28.1/2009
Shoham:
The Tel Aviv Purim carnival was the largest public event in Mandatory Palestine. However, due to its capitalistic character, the carnival has been ignored in the scholarship on the Zionist civil religion, which was regarded as having been created by the Zionist socialist/agricultural ethos alone. This article employs an anthropological methodology, analyzing the carnival as a pilgrimage event and revealing its ideological nationalist contents, which positioned Tel Aviv as a symbolic center of the *Yishuv* and thus powerfully presented the emerging nation in a visible manner. By exploring some common values shared by capitalism and nationalism, the analysis uncovers the ideological world of urban Zionism, which had far more impact on the sociocultural than on the political-institutional level.

Gershenson:
This article seeks to understand the place of the Russian immigrant community in the larger Israeli culture and to explore how immigrants themselves negotiate their position. One site of such negotiation is the film *Paper Snow* (2003) created predominantly by Russian-Israeli filmmakers. Their distinct vantage point emerges through the film's casting, genre, style, and language. *Paper Snow* features such iconic figures of Israeli culture-in-the-making as actress Hanna Rovina and poets Alexander Penn and Avraham Shlonsky, but represents them as part of the Russian intelligentsia. In this way, the film adheres to the familiar story of nation building, but tells it with an accent: by emphasizing the Russianness of the Israeli national past, the film inscribes contemporary Russian immigrants onto the grand narrative of the nation. By revising the official collective memory, *Paper Snow* produces accented memory.

Danel:
This article inquires into the reasons why the ideal type of ethnic democracy proposed by Smooha has no viable manifestation other than Israel. Ethnic democracy exists in the tensions between the two contradictory principles of inclusive and egalitarian democracy, on the one hand, and a preference for a majority ethnic group on the other. The archetype of the ideal type of ethnic democracy is Israel. Yet since the conceptual tool of ideal type was developed by Weber for the purpose of overcoming idiosyncrasies and discovering similarities, other manifestations of the ideal type must be found. Although Smooha presupposes that ethnic democracy is essentially "non-Western," he finds its manifestations mainly in "Western" democracies. He tries to overcome this difficulty by characterizing Israel as the sole embodiment of the ideal type of ethnic democracy. However, a comparison with West European democracies renders the ethnic attributes of Israeli democracy empirically dubious and logically circular.

Smooha
This is a response to Adam Danel's critique of my model of ethnic democracy. Danel argues that the model fails as an ideal type and as a comparative tool because ethnic democracy does not exist anywhere. I show, however, that there are indeed quite a few cases of ethnic democracy, although some are partial and some historical, including Estonia, Latvia, Northern Ireland from 1921 to 1972, Macedonia from 1991 to 2001, interwar Poland, Slovakia and Malaysia. Danel does not address the real functions of the model as a theory of the emergence and stability of ethnic democracy and as a conceptual scheme for the comparative study of ethnic democracies. The theory accounts for the developments of ethnic democracy in these states and for the conditions for its success and failure. Danel also tries to show that Israel is a Western liberal democracy by overstressing its liberal traits and the non-liberal characteristics of Western democracies. I argue that Israel's ideology, design, policies and practices as the homeland of the Jewish people, most of whom are not its citizens, and as the "property" of the Israeli-Jewish majority, means that it has a second-rate ethnic democracy and as a state and society does not qualify as Western.